| **Student Name:** Giselle Yap |
| --- |

| **Motion:** This house prefers a benevolent dictatorship compared to an unstable democracy |
| --- |

| Student spoke for the duration of the specified time frame. | N/A | 1 | 2 | 3 | 4 | **5** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| Student offered and/or accepted a point of information relevant to the topic. | N/A | **1** | 2 | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student spoke in a stylistic and persuasive manner (e.g. volume, speed, tone, diction, and flow). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s argument is complete in that it has relevant Claims, supported by sufficient Evidence/Warrants, Impacts, and Synthesis. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student argument reflects application of theory taught during class time. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student’s rebuttal is effective, and directly responds to an opponent’s arguments. | N/A | 1 | **2** | 3 | 4 | 5 |
| Student ably supported teammate’s case and arguments. | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Student applied feedback from previous debate(s). | N/A | 1 | 2 | **3** | 4 | 5 |
| Competition Score: | 70 | | | | | |
| Rubric  1 - Unobserved.  2 - Student attempt noted. Needs extended teacher support to properly execute skill.  3 - Student effort noted. Can execute skill with minimal teacher input and guidance.  4 - Student can execute skill with little to no prompting.  5 - Student can execute skill without prompting; exceeds expectations for child of that level. | | | | | | |
| **Teacher comments:**  [NOTE: Today’s speeches are 5 minutes’ long.]  Try not to reset your speech and just soldier on even when you make blunders.   * Good hook on political gridlocks that happen in unstable democracies.   + We are stopping short of stating that the most important thing in this debate is the ability to make progress, and improve any harmful situations in the status quo.   Don’t forget to signpost the rest of your speech.  Our rebuttal on people obeying the law due to their fear is precisely the harm that the Opposition is arguing!   * For those who need to fight injustice, what will happen to these people? * Actively re-characterise the traits of the benevolent leader, and why they won’t just engage in methods like killing the people. * We need to weigh which is more important.   + Explain that we prioritise access to basic necessities more than political freedoms.   On the inefficiency of a democracy, why exactly is it impossible for them to improve?   * We are ending too early by stating that it’s hard to fix instability. * Point out that it’s the inherent traits of democracy that causes the instability, so it’s not something that Opp can remove. Every type of democracy will suffer from in-fighting and gridlock.   We shouldn’t only reinforce the case by simply repeating what 1st Prop said, reinforce it by engaging with Opp’s criticisms against you.   * Opp says these dictators will oppress people significantly, don’t just concede this, push back!   On reinforcing the loss of stability:   * What are examples or grounding of the kind of long-term policies that society needs in order to progress? * On the efficiency of the dictator, we can explain precisely how political opponents make it impossible for structural reforms to be passed in democracies.   + We mentioned infrastructural development, but it isn’t clear why democracies won’t be able to allocate sufficient funding to these kinds of policies.     - Point out that fiscally conservative parties will always oppose these big ticket items to limit state spending.   On political gridlock:   * We need to spend more time on mechanistic analysis as to why it’s impossible for politicians to come to a compromise.   + Point out that it’s a political liability to make concessions, and you can always blame your opponents for causing gridlock. So it’s more rewarding to just fight against any new policy, instead of creating real legislative change.   The impacting of the above argument should include the human costs, explain that these policies make a tremendous difference in quality of life.  Please offer more POIs today!  5.20 | | | | | | |